

---

## **Table of Contents**

### **Table of Contents**

Executive Summary .....	iii
List of Acronyms .....	xi
List of Tables .....	xv
List of Figures .....	xx
Chapter I: Introduction .....	I-1
A.    Background .....	I-1
B.    Overview of the Proposal .....	I-2
1.    Vehicle Emission Standards .....	I-3
2.    Gasoline Sulfur Standards .....	I-3
Chapter II: Health and Welfare Concerns .....	II-1
A.    Ozone .....	II-1
1.    Health and Welfare Effects of Ozone .....	II-2
B.    Particulate Matter .....	II-4
1.    Health and Welfare Effects of Particulate Matter .....	II-5
C.    Carbon Monoxide .....	II-6
D.    Visibility and Regional Haze .....	II-7
Chapter II. References .....	II-9
Chapter III: Environmental Impact .....	III-1
A.    Inventory Impacts of Tier 2/Sulfur .....	III-1
1.    NOx .....	III-5
a.    Light-Duty NOx Trends Without Tier 2/Sulfur .....	III-5
b.    NOx Reductions Due To Tier 2/Sulfur .....	III-10
c.    NOx Emission Reductions From Other Options .....	III-15
2.    VOC .....	III-17
a.    Light-Duty VOC Trends Without Tier 2/Sulfur .....	III-17
b.    VOC Reductions Due To Tier 2/Sulfur .....	III-21
c.    VOC Emission Reductions From Other Options .....	III-26
3.    SOx .....	III-27
a.    Light-Duty SOx Trends Without Sulfur Control .....	III-27
b.    SOx Reductions Due To Sulfur Control .....	III-29
4.    Particulate Matter .....	III-30
a.    “No Growth” Diesel Sales Scenario .....	III-31
b.    “Increased Growth” Sales Scenario .....	III-35
B.    Air Quality Measures .....	III-39

## **Tier 2/Sulfur Draft Regulatory Impact Analysis - April 1999**

---

1.	Ozone .....	III-40
a.	Measures of Current Attainment and Non-attainment .....	III-40
b.	General Description of Ozone Modeling in the OTAG Domain to Estimate the Effect of Tier 2/Sulfur Controls .....	III-42
c.	The “Rollback Method” for Estimating Design Values Resulting from Control Measures .....	III-43
d.	Specific Simulations Used to Evaluate Tier 2/Sulfur .....	III-46
e.	Results of the NO <sub>x</sub> -only and VOC-only Runs .....	III-46
f.	Details of the Tier 2/Sulfur Ozone Modeling Runs .....	III-47
2.	Visibility/Regional Haze .....	III-49
C.	Air Toxics .....	III-50
1.	Health Effects .....	III-51
a.	Benzene .....	III-51
b.	1,3-Butadiene .....	III-53
c.	Formaldehyde .....	III-53
d.	Acetaldehyde .....	III-54
e.	Diesel Particulate Matter .....	III-55
2.	Assessment of Emissions and Exposure .....	III-57
a.	Emissions Modeling .....	III-57
b.	Nationwide Toxic Emissions Estimates – Baseline Scenario .....	III-62
c.	Exposure – Baseline Scenario .....	III-63
d.	Impact of Potential Vehicle and Fuel Controls .....	III-65
e.	Limitations .....	III-69
Chapter III. References .....		III-70
Chapter IV: Technological Feasibility .....		IV-1
A.	Feasibility of Tier 2 Exhaust Emission Standards for LDVs and LDTs .....	IV-1
1.	NMOG and NO <sub>x</sub> Emissions from Gasoline-Fueled Vehicles .....	IV-1
a.	Technology Description .....	IV-2
b.	Data Supporting Tier 2 Technical Feasibility .....	IV-14
c.	Lean-Burn Technology .....	IV-25
2.	CO Emissions from Gasoline Fueled Vehicles .....	IV-25
3.	Formaldehyde Emissions from Gasoline Fueled Vehicles .....	IV-26
4.	Evaporative Emissions .....	IV-27
5.	Diesel Vehicles .....	IV-28
B.	Feasibility of Removing Sulfur from Gasoline .....	IV-29
1.	Source of Gasoline Sulfur .....	IV-29
2.	Current Levels of Sulfur in Gasoline .....	IV-30
3.	Feasibility of Meeting the Proposed Gasoline Sulfur Standards .....	IV-32
4.	Meeting a Low Sulfur Gasoline Standard .....	IV-33
5.	Improved Gasoline Desulfurization Technology .....	IV-37
6.	Expected Desulfurization Technology to be Used by Refiners .....	IV-40
7.	Feasibility for a Low Gasoline Sulfur Standard in 2004 .....	IV-40

---

## Table of Contents

8. Phase In of Compliance with the Proposed Sulfur Standards .....	IV-45
Chapter IV. References .....	IV-51
Chapter V: Economic Impact .....	V-1
A. Impact of Tier 2 Standards on Vehicle Costs .....	V-1
1. Manufacturer Costs for Tier 2 Vehicles .....	V-1
a. Methodology .....	V-1
b. Hardware Costs for Exhaust Emissions Control .....	V-3
c. Hardware Costs for Evaporative Emissions Control .....	V-15
d. Assembly Costs .....	V-17
e. Development and Capital Costs .....	V-17
f. Total Near-term and Long-term Manufacturer Costs .....	V-19
2. Tier 2 Vehicle Consumer Costs .....	V-22
3. Annual Total Nationwide Costs for Tier 2 Vehicles .....	V-23
a. Overview of Nationwide Vehicle Costs .....	V-23
b. Methodology .....	V-24
c. Estimates of Total Nationwide Vehicle Costs by Vehicle Class .....	V-26
B. Gasoline Desulfurization Costs .....	V-30
1. Methodology .....	V-30
a. Cost Inputs .....	V-33
b. Determination of Blendstock Sulfur Levels .....	V-41
2. The Cost of Desulfurizing Gasoline .....	V-46
a. The Cost of the Averaging Standard .....	V-46
b. Verification of the Desulfurization Cost Based on the Improved Technologies .....	V-50
c. Future Cost of Desulfurization .....	V-52
d. Comparison with Previous Cost Estimates .....	V-55
3. Other Effects of This Program .....	V-58
a. Effect of the Cap Standard .....	V-58
b. Other Effects on the Refining Industry .....	V-60
c. Refinery Energy and Global Warming Impacts .....	V-62
4. Per Vehicle Life-Cycle Fuel Costs .....	V-70
5. Aggregate Annual Fuel Costs .....	V-73
a. Methodology .....	V-74
b. Explanation of Results .....	V-75
C. Combined Vehicle and Fuel Costs .....	V-80
1. Combined Costs Per Vehicle .....	V-80
2. Combined Total Annual Nationwide Costs .....	V-80
Chapter V. References .....	V-83
Chapter VI: Cost-Effectiveness .....	VI-1
A. Overview of the Analysis .....	VI-1

## Tier 2/Sulfur Draft Regulatory Impact Analysis - April 1999

---

1.	Temporal and Geographic Applicability .....	VI-1
2.	Baselines .....	VI-2
B.	Costs .....	VI-4
1.	Near and Long-Term Cost Accounting .....	VI-4
2.	Vehicle and Fuel Costs .....	VI-5
3.	Cost Crediting for PM and SO <sub>2</sub> .....	VI-5
C.	Emission Reductions .....	VI-7
1.	NOx and NMHC .....	VI-7
2.	Irreversibility .....	VI-11
3.	Primary Particulate Matter .....	VI-13
4.	Sulfur Dioxide .....	VI-14
D.	Results .....	VI-15
APPENDIX VI-A :	Discounted Lifetime Tonnage Values for Exhaust Emissions .....	VI-20
APPENDIX VI-B :	Discounted Lifetime Tonnage Values for Evaporative Emissions ..	VI-24
Chapter VI. References .....	VI-25	
Chapter VII: Benefit-Cost Analysis .....	VII-1	
A.	Emissions .....	VII-2
B.	Air Quality Impacts .....	VII-6
1.	Ozone Air Quality Estimates .....	VII-6
a.	Modeling Domain .....	VII-7
b.	Simulation Periods .....	VII-8
c.	UAM-V Model Output .....	VII-8
d.	Converting Episode Estimates to Full-Season Profiles .....	VII-8
e.	Extrapolating from Monitored to Unmonitored Locations ..	VII-9
f.	Ozone Air Quality Results .....	VII-10
2.	PM Air Quality Estimates .....	VII-11
a.	Climatological Regional Dispersion Model .....	VII-12
b.	Development of the S-R Matrix .....	VII-12
c.	Fugitive Dust Adjustment Factor .....	VII-13
d.	Normalizing S-R Matrix Results to Measured Data .....	VII-14
e.	Development of Annual Median PM <sub>2.5</sub> Concentrations ..	VII-15
f.	PM Air Quality Results .....	VII-15
3.	Nitrogen Deposition Estimates .....	VII-16
4.	Visibility Degradation Estimates Using the S-R Matrix .....	VII-18
C.	Benefits Assessment .....	VII-19
1.	Overview of Benefits Estimation .....	VII-20
2.	Issues in Estimating Changes in Health Effects .....	VII-27
a.	Baseline Incidences .....	VII-31
b.	Thresholds .....	VII-31
3.	PM- and Ozone-related Health Effects .....	VII-31

---

## Table of Contents

a.	Premature Mortality .....	VII-32
b.	Chronic Bronchitis .....	VII-37
c.	Hospital Admissions .....	VII-39
d.	Acute Bronchitis .....	VII-43
e.	PM-related Upper Respiratory Symptoms .....	VII-43
f.	PM-related Lower Respiratory Symptoms .....	VII-44
g.	Ozone-related Any of 19 Respiratory Symptoms .....	VII-45
h.	Work Loss Days .....	VII-46
i.	Minor Restricted Activity Days .....	VII-46
j.	Worker Productivity .....	VII-47
4.	Ozone- and PM-Related Welfare Effects .....	VII-48
a.	Commodity Agricultural Crops .....	VII-48
b.	Nitrogen Deposition .....	VII-49
c.	Household Soiling Damage .....	VII-52
d.	Visibility .....	VII-53
e.	Ozone- and PM-related Welfare Effect Benefits Estimation	VII-57
5.	Total Aggregated Benefits .....	VII-57
6.	Sensitivity Analyses .....	VII-58
7.	Limitations of the Analysis .....	VII-60
a.	PM Mortality Risk and Health Effects .....	VII-62
b.	Unquantifiable Benefits .....	VII-63
c.	Potential Disbenefits .....	VII-66
d.	Projected Income Growth .....	VII-68
D.	Cost .....	VII-68
	Chapter VII References .....	VII-70
	Chapter VIII: Regulatory Flexibility .....	VIII-1
A.	Requirements of the Regulatory Flexibility Act .....	VIII-1
B.	Description of Affected Entities .....	VIII-2
1.	Small Refiners .....	VIII-3
2.	Small Petroleum Marketers .....	VIII-4
3.	Small Certifiers of Covered Vehicles .....	VIII-4
C.	Projected Costs of the Proposed Gasoline Sulfur Standards .....	VIII-5
D.	The Types and Number of Small Entities to Which the Proposed Rule Would Apply .....	VIII-5
E.	Projected Reporting, Recordkeeping, and Other Compliance Requirements of the Proposed Rule .....	VIII-6
F.	Other Relevant Federal Rules Which May Duplicate, Overlap, or Conflict with the Proposed Rule .....	VIII-7
G.	Regulatory Alternatives .....	VIII-7
1.	Small Refiners .....	VIII-7
a.	Interim Sulfur Standards .....	VIII-8
b.	Hardship Relief .....	VIII-10

## **Tier 2/Sulfur Draft Regulatory Impact Analysis - April 1999**

---

2. Small Certifiers of Covered Vehicles .....	VIII-11
Chapter VIII. References .....	VIII-13
Appendix A: 47-State and Four-Cities Analyses .....	A-1
Appendix B: Evidence Supporting the Irreversibility of Sulfur's Emission Impact .....	B-1
A. Exhaust Emission Sensitivity to Sulfur Content .....	B-1
B. Theory Supporting the Reversibility and Irreversibility of Sulfur's Emission Impact .....	B-3
C. Results of Sulfur Reversibility Test Programs .....	B-6
1. Coordinating Research Council (CRC) Sulfur Reversibility Program ..	B-6
2. American Petroleum Institute Sulfur Reversibility Program .....	B-8
3. Johnson Matthey Sulfur Reversibility Program .....	B-13
4. Other Testing .....	B-15
D. Criteria for Evaluating Sulfur Reversibility Data .....	B-15
E. Projected Levels of Sulfur Irreversibility In-Use .....	B-18
Appendix C: One-Hour and Eight-Hour County Design Values .....	C-1
Appendix D: EPA's Legal Authority for Proposing Gasoline Sulfur Controls .....	D-1
A. EPA's Current Regulatory Requirements for Gasoline .....	D-1
B. How the Proposed Gasoline Sulfur Control Program Meets the CAA Section 211(c) Criteria .....	D-2
1. Health and Welfare Concerns of Air Pollution Caused by Sulfur in Gasoline .....	D-2
2. Impact of Gasoline Sulfur Emission Products on Emission Control Systems .....	D-3
3. Sulfur Levels that Tier 2 Vehicles Can Tolerate .....	D-4
4. Sulfur Sensitivity of Other Catalysts .....	D-6
5. Effect of Gasoline Sulfur Control on the Use of Other Fuels or Fuel Additives .....	D-7